

III. EXISTING CONDITIONS, IMPACTS AND MITIGATION

L. Parking

L. Parking

1. Existing Conditions

The existing site consists of four uses, each having its own parking requirement as stipulated in Chapter 300 of the Town of Yorktown’s Zoning Code and as summarized in Table III.L.1.

Table III.L.1 Existing Parking				
Use	Parking Spaces Required	Sizes	Parking Spaces Required	Parking Spaces Provided
Motel ⁽¹⁾				
rooms	1.1 /room	48 Rooms	53	
restaurant	1.0 /50 sf	2,700 sf Restaurant	54	
additional	20 spaces	-	<u>20</u>	
Total	-	-	127	82
Nursery ⁽²⁾	10.0 (min)	1 Nursery	10	10
King Gates ⁽³⁾	5.0 /1000 sf	1,326 sf	7	7
Residence #1 ⁽⁴⁾	1.0 /res	1 Residence	1	1
Residence #2 ⁽⁴⁾	1.0 /res	1 Residence	1	1
Notes:				
⁽¹⁾ Yorktown Code Reference Section 300-155				
⁽²⁾ Yorktown Code Reference Section 300-65				
⁽³⁾ Yorktown Code Reference Section 300-182				
⁽⁴⁾ Yorktown Code Reference Section 300-26				

2. Potential Impacts

a. Town Code Requirements

Costco Wholesale is a “discount club” that serves both the retail and wholesale sectors of the community. Chapter 300-182 of the Town of Yorktown’s Zoning Code specifies the off-street parking requirements for various uses. Subsection A.(3)(a) of the referenced chapter states that parking for retail in zone C-3 is 5 parking spaces per 1,000 square feet of gross building area (5.0 parking index). The Proposed Action, having a gross building area of 151,092 square feet, if considered retail, would require 756 parking spaces in accordance with this chapter reference. Subsection A.(6) states that wholesale and storage use requires parking at a rate of one space for each two persons for which the building is designed. Since the building has both retail and wholesale use, it is difficult to assign a “number of persons for which the building is designed”. Therefore, no parking calculation for wholesale use is provided. It is noted, based upon the following distinguishing

characteristics, that the number of parking spaces for wholesale use would clearly be less than for retail.

Some of the characteristics of the Costco Wholesale that differentiate it from the typical retail use are described following.

1. Costco is a Discount Wholesale Club and its operation of business has certain qualities that differentiate it from a traditional retail use, such as a shopping center. One such differentiating characteristic that marks Costco's uniqueness is that it draws from a "members only" customer base. The Costco members are only a portion of the general shopping population and therefore its shopping base is drawn from a smaller pool than for typical retail.
2. Another differentiating characteristic is that Costco Wholesale supports the local business community by providing goods in bulk volume. Small local businesses such as restaurants and "mom and pop" shops are typically supported by this convenience. Sale of larger bulk quantities also tends to translate to a reduced number of visits to the store per shopper.
3. Thirdly, the Costco building is designed such that much of its floor area is dedicated to other uses than typical retail. For example, the overall building area includes substantial area dedicated to employee services, loading and offloading, storage, entry vestibule and food preparation. In addition to the referenced non-retail area the remaining floor area is larger than traditional retail as typified by wider aisles to allow for large flat carts and wider storage areas to account for large bulk items aimed at wholesale use and warehouse-type storage.

Due to Costco's differentiating characteristics as described above, the Applicant reports that the parking demand for the typical Costco is less than the 5.0 parking index used for typical retail uses. The Project proposes 610 parking spaces, which would provide 4.04 parking spaces per 1,000 square feet of gross building area. Costco's operations group indicates that 610 parking spaces is the appropriate parking goal for this Costco facility (see subsection d). Thus, the Applicant indicates that since the Costco Wholesale is a combined retail/wholesale use, its parking requirement is not accurately reflected in Subsection A.(3)(a) of the referenced Zoning Code and the parking requirement should be less than that indicated for typical retail use. The Town's Zoning Code, in fact, does allow for special consideration by the Planning Board with regard to parking requirements when the use is not specifically listed.

Subsection A of Chapter 300-182 describes parking requirements for various uses, including but not limited to retail and wholesale. Subsection B of the

same Chapter provides flexibility regarding the parking requirements for uses that are not specifically described under subsection A as described following.

Reasonable and appropriate off-street parking requirements for structures and land uses which do not fall within categories listed above (subsection A) shall be determined in each case by the Planning Board, which shall consider all factors entering into the parking needs of each such use.

Since a combined retail/wholesale use is not listed, the Applicant believes that the parking requirement for this particular building use qualifies for individual consideration by the Planning Board. The Applicant requests that the parking requirement be determined by the Planning Board based on Costco’s individualized shopping characteristics as evidenced by operating experience for similar sites.

The following paragraphs provide additional justification for the proposed 610 parking spaces and support of the proposed 4.04 parking index.

b. ITE Analysis

Parking Generation, 4th Edition (2010), published by the Institute of Transportation Engineers (ITE), provides data on parking demand as measured in vehicles per 1,000 sq. ft. of floor area derived from actual field studies. The following Table lists the ITE average and 85th percentile parking ratios for a Discount Club:

TABLE III.L.2 ITE Parking Ratios for Discount Club		
USE/Peak Period	Peak Parking Demand (in vehicles per 1,000 sq. ft. GLA)	
	Average	85th Percentile
Weekday (PM)	2.22	3.34
Weekend (Midday Peak)	2.90	3.93

A review of the above Table indicates that both average and 85th percentile actual peak parking demands for Discount Clubs fall below the 4.04 spaces per 1,000 square feet supplied for the proposed Costco project.

c. NYSDEC Recommendation for Parking Area Reduction

Additional support for reduction of parking spaces is provided in the New York State Department of Environmental Conservation Stormwater Design Manual. Chapter 5 of the DEC Manual addresses green infrastructure practices and includes recommendations for employing runoff reduction techniques. One such recommendation, included in section 5.2.6 of the

Manual, is to reduce impervious area in parking lots through the elimination of what the DEC refers to as unnecessary parking stalls. Table 5.4 of the DEC Manual (source: CWP, 1998; modified NYSDEC, 2010) indicates a standard required parking ratio for shopping centers is 5 spaces per 1,000 s.f. of GFA but the actual parking demand is 3.97 spaces per 1,000 s.f. of GFA. This lower parking demand is consistent with ITE findings for a discount club.

In support of the DEC's recommendation to reduce impervious area through elimination of what they refer to as unneeded parking spaces, the Applicant proposes parking at a ratio (4.04) very near the "demand" (3.97) as cited above and in their Manual. (See Section III.G.3 for additional discussion regarding parking and reduction of impervious area.) The Applicant also proposes minimizing impervious area through the modification of parking stall dimensions, which is discussed in paragraph "2.g" of this section.

In keeping with the intent to preserve natural resources, the Applicant's proposal will avoid placing impervious area within Wetland A buffer. The Project Site contains a DEP regulated watercourse which is situated within Wetland A (discussed in Sections III.F and III.G of this DEIS). A 100-foot buffer around Wetland A is regulated by the Town of Yorktown. The proposed site plan results in disturbance generally within the outer half of the Wetland A buffer but, for the most part the inner half remains undisturbed. The outer portion will be disturbed through grading operations after which it will be stabilized and re-vegetated. If a higher parking ratio was required, it would result in greater impact to the wetland buffer including placement of impervious parking area within the outer half of the buffer. Therefore, the Applicant feels that the proposed plan eliminates what the DEC considers "unnecessary parking spaces" and supports the intent to preserve open space.

d. Costco Historic Data

Costco management and their operations group report that the proposed Costco Wholesale can operate successfully with 610 parking spaces. A comparative study based on analysis of data collected from the other existing Costco facilities in the region (Port Chester, Yonkers, New Rochelle, Nanuet and Brookfield) as described hereafter supports this claim.

The actual number of member groups entering a Costco Warehouse (door counts) is recorded at each Costco facility. (It is assumed that each member group represents a single vehicle.) The member groups are counted and recorded in half hour increments. The peak hour is determined by combining the two highest consecutive counts. Costco management has conducted interviews with members and from this data, estimates the average shopping time to be 40 minutes. A 10 minute cushion to provide a more conservative estimate was added and thus a 50 minute shopping time was used for this analysis. The maximum number of employees present during the busiest shift

was accounted for by adding 75 employees to the adjusted peak hour door count. The use of 75 employees is conservative since experience shows that some employees will carpool and the maximum number of employees only occurs during overlapping shifts.

Data used for analysis represented the average monthly parking demands based on counts from August 2011 and the seasonal high parking demand based on counts from December 2010 at the above referenced Costco locations. The August parking demands were less than the demands for December. Therefore, this analysis focuses on the December data which represents the peak demand period. The referenced parking data is shown on Table III.L.3. Additional data is included in Appendix VII.N of this DEIS.

The data indicates that the peak customer parking demand occurred on weekends with the peak day being Sunday. The peak Sunday demand was 546 spaces. The peak weekday demand was 461 spaces. When peak demands for various days were combined, the peak parking demand was 551 spaces. Therefore, based on these results, the Applicant anticipates that the seasonal high parking demand for the Proposed Action can be expected to be around 551 spaces, which represents a parking index of 3.65.

A summary of the parking data for each of the referenced stores is provided in Table III.L.3. The table includes the store location, size, parking spaces constructed, door count, parking demand adjusted for shopping period, parking demand adjusted for peak number of employees and finally the peak parking demand. The table includes data for these stores during both the August and December time periods.

It is noted that the data shown in Table III.L.3 reveals no distinct direct correlation between the building size and the parking demand. Therefore, Costco expects the parking demand for this proposed store to be similar to the other referenced Costcos. The greatest parking demand for the referenced facilities, as shown in the table is 600 parking spaces, which again, supports the proposed number of 610 spaces for the Proposed Action. It is also noted, that the peak parking demand occurred only within a portion of the one-hour period.

TABLE III.L.3
Peak Parking Demand Summary for Similar Costco Facilities (December 2010)

Costco Facility Location	Building Area (sf)	Parking Approved and Constructed	Peak Hourly Door Count (Member Groups) (1)			Member Parking Demand (Adjusted for Average Shopping Period)			Parking Demand Adjusted for			Total Peak Parking Demand
			Weekday	Saturday	Sunday	50 minutes (2)			75 employees			# of Members and Employees
						Weekday	Saturday	Sunday	Weekday	Saturday	Sunday	
Yonkers, NY	143,312	745	420	628	630	350	523	525	425	598	600	600
Brookfield, CT	126,387	676	568	592	619	473	493	516	548	568	591	591
Nanuet, NY	120,510	632	560	597	601	467	498	501	542	573	576	576
New Rochelle, NY	136,902	679	375	517	550	313	431	458	388	506	533	533
Port Chester, NY	146,703	593	391	454	428	326	378	357	401	453	432	453
Average	134,763	665	463	558	566	386	465	471	461	540	546	551

Peak Parking Demand Summary for Similar Costco Facilities (August 2011)

Costco Facility Location	Building Area (sf)	Parking Approved and Constructed	Peak Hourly Door Count (Member Groups) (1)			Member Parking Demand (Adjusted for Average Shopping Period)			Parking Demand Adjusted for			Total Peak Parking Demand
			Weekday	Saturday	Sunday	50 minutes (2)			75 employees			# of Members and Employees
						Weekday	Saturday	Sunday	Weekday	Saturday	Sunday	
Yonkers, NY	143,312	745	460	501	601	383	418	501	458	493	576	576
Brookfield, CT	126,387	676	398	486	517	332	405	431	407	480	506	506
Nanuet, NY	120,510	632	527	528	524	439	440	437	514	515	512	515
New Rochelle, NY	136,902	679	337	453	417	281	378	348	356	453	423	453
Port Chester, NY	146,703	593	324	452	444	270	377	370	345	452	445	452
Average	134,763	665	409	484	501	341	403	417	416	478	492	500

Notes:
 (1) Member door count. Each member group represents one vehicle.
 (2) Average shopping period reported by Costco is 40 minutes (based on customer interview). A 10 minute cushion was added to provide a more conservative estimate and thus a 50 minute shopping time was used for this analysis.

e. Retail Floor Area Calculation

As stated earlier, Costco Wholesale is not typical retail as it requires additional floor area to accommodate large wholesale bulk items as well as providing floor area required by other nonretail support functions. Larger aisles are provided to accommodate large carts as well as forklifts to stock the shelves. Aisle widths are generally around 50% wider than typical grocery aisles (10.5' vs. 7') Within the Costco building footprint, the following excess aisle and nonretail support areas include:

- Larger aisles = 24,600 sf (73,827 sf total building aisle area)
- Food preparation = 8,722 sf
- Loading and unloading = 5,995 sf
- Employee services = 5,124 sf
- Vestibule = 3,338 sf
- Pump Room = 370 sf
- Subtotal nonretail = 48,149 sf

When the nonretail area is removed from the total, the remaining retail floor area is approximately 102,943 square feet. The resultant ratio of parking spaces (610 parking spaces) to retail floor area is 5.93 spaces per 1,000 square feet, which exceeds the Town's parking requirement for standard retail use.

f. Summary of Parking Requirement Analysis

The Applicant believes that the analysis presented previously in this section provides ample support that the proposed parking supply will adequately accommodate the proposed use. The noted ITE, DEC and Costco sources indicate that the proposed parking supply will be sufficient to serve the parking demand. Based on that analysis, it is the Applicant's belief that the proposed 610 parking spaces (parking index of 4.04) will adequately meet the proposed project demand and that the parking requirement for the Costco Wholesale should be given individual consideration by the Planning Board.

Table III.L.4 provides a summary of the parking standards from the various planning sources discussed above as compared to the parking provided for the Proposed Action.

Table III.L.4 Parking Standards						
Parking Category	Yorktown Code (1)	ITE	NYSDEC	Costco Historic Data	Costco Retail Area	Parking Provided (2)
Parking Index (3)	5.0	3.93	3.97	3.65	5.93 (4)	4.04
Parking Spaces	756	594	600	551	610	610
Notes: (1) Typical retail use per Chapter 300-182 A.(3)(a) (2) Planning Board individual and appropriate consideration requested per Chapter 300-182 B of the Town Code. (3) Parking spaces per 1,000 square feet of gross building floor area (Building area = 151,092) (except where noted) (4) Parking spaces per 1,000 square feet of retail floor area (retail area = 102,943 sf)						

g. Parking Stall Dimensions

Chapter 300-182 of the Yorktown Zoning Code identifies the minimum standard parking stall dimensions to be 9-feet by 18.5-feet. Costco’s nationwide standard parking stall dimensions exceed Yorktown’s minimum standard. Their standard dimensions are 10-feet by 20-feet. Costco implements this standard based on their unique operation as a retail/wholesale warehouse. Retail customers require added space adjacent to their parked vehicles to unload goods from their shopping carts into their vehicles. Wholesale customers, shopping in bulk, also require the added space to accommodate the even larger flat carts to transport their bulk items for unloading.

In an effort to reduce impervious area and the overall size of the parking lot, Costco has agreed to reduce their parking stall dimensions for most of their parking spaces. The project proposes several varied stall sizes. The most notable reduction is in the overall length of the parking stall to 18.5-feet. These 10-feet by 18.5-feet stalls make up approximately 47% of the overall parking count. They are located nearer to the building and are noted as prime parking spaces. A further reduction in size to 9-feet by 18.5-feet and 9-feet by 20-feet is made to approximately 48% of the parking stalls, all of which are located along the perimeter and more remote areas of the parking lot. The remaining 5% of the parking spaces are either ADA compliant or are located adjacent to the building where the full 20-foot length is provided. Table III.L.5 summarizes the varied parking stalls that are proposed for the project.

Table III.L-5 Proposed Parking Stall Dimensions			
Parking Stall Dimensions	Number of Parking Stalls	% of Total Parking	General Location
10' x 18.5'	286	47%	Prime Parking
9' x 18.5'	271	44%	Perimeter Parking
9' x 20'	25	4%	Adjacent to Bldg
10' x 20'	16	3%	Prime Parking
8' x 18.5' (1)	12	2%	ADA Compliant
Total	610	100%	
Note: (1) ADA spaces are provided with an adjacent 8' wide striped aisle.			

If all the parking stalls were sized to meet the Town’s minimum parking stall dimensions of 9-feet by 18.5-feet, approximately 33 parking spaces could be added. Costco indicates that since they require the larger stalls, an alternative with the smaller stalls would not be conducive to Costco’s operation and would not be acceptable to them.

h. Secondary Positive Benefits

Limiting the size of the parking area by reducing the parking stall dimensions and the overall number of proposed parking spaces will yield secondary positive environmental benefits including reduction of impervious surface, stormwater runoff and land disturbance within wetland buffer.

3. Proposed Mitigation Measures

a. Public Transportation

Increased use of public transportation could reduce the reliance on individual vehicular transportation and therefore reduce the need for onsite parking. At present, the Bee Line Bus Service has a bus stop at the intersection of Strang Boulevard and Route 202/35, which is approximately ¼ mile east of the Project Site. The Applicant’s traffic consultant (John Collins Engineers, P.C.) explored with Westchester County the possibility of adding an additional bus stop in front of the site. Based on their discussion it has been determined that it is unlikely that an additional bus stop in front of the Costco site will be permitted by the County based on the proximity of the existing stop at Strang Boulevard.

In conjunction with the offsite highway improvements to Route 202/35, a sidewalk connecting Strang Boulevard to the Project Site is proposed along the north side of Route 202/35. This sidewalk will extend along the entire site frontage thereby improving the ease of pedestrian access from the bus stop to

the Project Site and destinations further west. The use of public transportation could lead to reductions in employee/customer related traffic, reduce air emissions, including carbon and could also reduce the demand for parking.

b. *Bicycle Transportation/Parking*

According to information obtained from the Sustainable Development Study, the Town of Yorktown Comprehensive Plan and the Mid-Hudson South Region Bicycle and Pedestrian Master Plan there is a plan for a walking/bicycle path to connect Yorktown Heights with the Bear Mountain Parkway Annsville Circle. The western portion of the trail will be built on Bear Mountain Parkway and Bear Mountain Parkway Extension right-of-way land. Near the Taconic State Parkway it will utilize an existing pedestrian overpass to connect to Strang Boulevard. The path will continue along Strang Boulevard to the south to connect with FDR State Park. From there the path will join a Town spur that will connect with the North County Trailway via Downing Drive.

Consistent with the recommendations of the Town of Yorktown Comprehensive Plan, the Sustainable Development Study and the NYSDOT's policy for the treatment of bicycle and pedestrian paths, associated with road widening in the vicinity of the TSP interchange, the provision of a sidewalk and a bikeway (paved shoulder) on Route 202/35 connecting to Strang Boulevard with a pedestrian signal controlled crosswalk to the FDR State Park will be provided subject to review and approval by NYSDOT. This will provide a connection from the site to the proposed trail way through FDR Park and along Strang Boulevard.

The Project-related offsite improvements will include the provision of a 6-foot wide paved shoulder to accommodate bike transportation along the eastbound and westbound sides of Route 202/35 extending from Strang Boulevard to the western limit of the Project Site. Improvements will also include pedestrian/bike crossings at Strang Boulevard to the FDR Park and at the Project Site driveway. With these improvements, bike traffic would be accommodated safely to the Proposed Costco. In conjunction with the NYSDOT improvements to Route 202/35, paved shoulders are proposed to extend west from the Project Site frontage, thereby accommodating bike traffic to destinations further west. Construction of these bike lanes will provide a safer bike transportation route along the 202/35 corridor.

It is likely that few shoppers would access the proposed Costco by bicycle since carrying bulk shopping goods by bicycle is impractical. In the event that employees from nearby residential areas may travel by bicycle or shoppers that desire to buy only minimal goods, bike parking racks are proposed.